

2015年中欧NGO交换项目报告

林佳乔，磐石环境与能源研究所 (REEI)，2016 年 1 月于北京



交换伙伴

Sanjeev Kumar, 布鲁塞尔改变伙伴机构 (Change Partnership)

Change Partnership 是布鲁塞尔一家 NGO 智库机构，主要的工作集中在气候变化政治领域。旨在通过分析政策解决方案和形成多方政策同盟来形成能影响立法结果的产出。机构成立于 2013 年，已经在布鲁塞尔、华沙和伦敦设有代表或者办公室。

交换的题目

气候变化和低碳发展：能源与气候变化政策对于工业竞争力的影响以及高碳地区的低碳转型模式讨论

改变伙伴机构与磐石环境与能源研究所 (REEI)在过去的一年中就交换题目中的一些具体方面进行了较深入的研究，主要集中在如何利用碳市场和碳金融来驱动低碳投资并助推区域经济的可持续增长。

我们的合作项目最终目的是要建立一个多方参与的对话机制，让不同的利益相关方能更有效地进行交流，他们可能会是来自于中国和欧洲的地区政府、行业协会以及产业界代表。通过多方共同探讨，有助于识别向低碳经济更快过渡的潜在合作机会，因为中国和欧洲面临类似的问题和挑战，尤其是政策敏感地区通常是受一个或几个高碳强度产业所支配，而这些产业又恰恰为当地提供了主要的经济增长和就业岗位支持。如果不能解决这些潜在的矛盾，气候和能源政策想要带来预期的低碳转型之路将颇为坎坷。

在中国的主要活动

Sanjeev 在 2015 年 8 月份来到中国，然后我们一起参加了在杭州举办的交换项目启动会。会后的两个星期左右的时间我陪同 Sanjeev 在杭州、上海和北京等地进行了一系列的参访，我们也在这期间于北京举办了一场关于碳市场的讨论会。通过这些访谈和讨论活动，让 Sanjeev 更加了解我们要完成的工作所处的中国政策和产业环境如何，通过与行业相关专家在能源和气候变化政策方面的交流也增长了我们对自己议题的认识。

- **组织并举办了一场碳市场讨论会**

磐石同 Change Partnership 一起，在 2015 年 9 月 14 日于北京举办了一场碳市场讨论会，比较分析 EU-ETS 和中国碳市场试点各自的特点，也有欧盟嘉宾关于 EU-ETS 经验的分享。我们邀请了欧盟驻中国和蒙古气候与环境官员 Vicky Pollard 女士，以及处于行业领先的中创碳投碳咨询公司的陈志斌先生。参加活动的人士来自于多个背景，有 NGOs、智库、学者、媒体以及产业界代表。

通过嘉宾报告和现场讨论，与会人员更好的了解到基于欧盟碳市场的经验，中国要建立一个运作良好的全国统一碳市场需要哪些条件，这一市场机制对于产业界的潜在影响，以及向低碳经济过渡需要考虑哪些方面。

- **访谈**

在 Sanjeev 的中国行程中，我们安排了很多访谈，大都集中在 2015 年的 9 月份。主要的访谈对象是在碳市场、电动汽车相关产业包括电池制造企业、研究人员以及 NGO。

- ✓ **碳市场**

- 北京环境交易所 (CBEX): 我们访问了北京环境交易所的碳市场研究组，与该团队探讨了中国碳市场未来的发展，特别是北京碳市场试点的情况。对方也对欧盟碳市场的经验很感兴趣，我们也就此交流了想法。
- 上海环境与能源交易所 (SEEE): 交易所的总裁助理李瑾博士代表会见了我们，她介绍了交易所的工作进展尤其是上海碳交易试点的成功经验，也对未来中国碳市场的发展做了展望。

- 上海置信碳资产公司：我们访谈了置信碳资产的项目开发团队和研究团队负责人，并了解到更多关于中国核证抵消量 (CCER) 的信息，他们也就未来碳市场的发展发表了自己的看法。
- Vicky Pollard 女士 (欧盟驻中国和蒙古环境与气候变化官员)：她介绍了她在中国的工作，并就气候变化高级别政策发展分享了自己的看法。

✓ 电动汽车

- 南都电源：国内最大的电池制造企业之一，我们同南都电源的浙江公司总经理进行了较深入的对话，他向我们介绍了公司的发展规模，以及他对于国内外未来储能和电动汽车发展趋势的见解。他们对于欧盟这个较大的潜在市场表现出很大的兴趣。
- 同济大学：我们访问了汽车学院的吴小员副教授，她的专业领域是新能源政策研究。吴教授给我们详细讲解了中国电动汽车发展的最新进展，同时也向我们询问了欧盟电动汽车发展的情况。
- 能源基金会：基金会的交通政策顾问跟我们见了面，通过谈话让我们更清楚的了解了中国的交通政策以及能源基金会对于中国未来交通领域的大致工作方向。

同时，Sanjeev 自己也在北京拜访了几个使馆工作于能源与气候变化领域的相关官员。

• 分析文章

我们正在撰写一篇关于中国交通电力化及其对欧盟意义的分析文章，主要是针对于欧盟的相关人士，让他们能快速和较全面的了解中国电动汽车产业，以及欧盟应该如何更高效地促进双方的合作。除了电动汽车之外，此文章也讨论了电动自行车，因其在中国居民过去十年交通电力化中的重要作用不容忽视。

欧洲的主要活动

能作为磐石的代表参与此次中欧 NGO 交换项目中对我来说很有意义，并有幸能同 Sanjeev 结成交换伙伴。在 2015 年 11 月 1 日到 12 月 11 日这段期间，我在欧洲停留了将近 6 个星期的时间，大部分时间是在布鲁塞尔度过，同 Sanjeev 一起工作，并参加了多次颇有深度的高级别讨论会等活动，同当地的 NGO 伙伴进行了交流让我受益良多。同时也在这个欧盟首都见识了社会各界为自身权益奔走呐喊，感受到政策的制定过程有时候是一个多方呼吁但很多时候是会形成一个妥协性政策。除此之外，我也在周边不同国家进行了一系列有针对性的关于气候变化和能源议题的访谈。

• 会议参加

由于布鲁塞尔作为欧盟最高的行政机构所在地，在此有很多高级别的会议和活动是向所有公众开放；我选择参加了其中关于碳市场和工业政策的活动。通过参加这些活动让我更好的了解了欧盟机构是如何运作的，政策制定过程如何，这对中国本土 NGO 是有借鉴意义的，虽然制度本身不同，但方法是大致相似的。

• 巴黎气候变化大会 COP21

感谢 CCAN 帮我注册，得以见证巴黎气候变化大会，在 COP21 的第二个星期，我参加了不同机构组织的多场会议和活动，尤其是碳市场和能源问题领域。这也是一个跟其他潜在合作机构以及基金会很好的碰面商谈的场所。

• 访谈

除了在布鲁塞尔的会议，我在欧洲期间还进行了一些访谈，借由在欧洲的便利条件，可以较方便的接触到有兴趣的相关机构。

- ✓ 伦敦：跟 Sanjeev 一起，我们访谈了英国的能源与气候变化部，与 EU-ETS 团队讨论了关于欧盟碳市场的改革。此外，在伦敦还跟 Client Earth 进行了会面，机构负责人 James Thornton 先生也抽出时间与我们交流，对于磐石在北京的工作很感兴趣，尤其是能源和空气污染方面议题方面。
- ✓ 德国：去柏林的访谈进行的非常高效和顺利，我拜访了 Agora 能源转型智库的研究人员；也同 German Watch 德国和欧盟气候政策团队的负责人碰面，深入讨论的 NGO 在德国能源转型中的角色。此外，我也采访了国际碳行动伙伴计划 (ICAP) 的中国项目联系人，交换了有关中国碳市场

的想法。最后，受到伯尔基金会的邀请到他们总部座谈，与中国和巴基斯坦地区项目经理以及生态可持续发展部门主管进行了交流。

- ✓ 法国：来自于法国可持续发展与能源部的官员同我见面，我们就欧盟碳市场的发展与改革交换了想法，尤其是在碳泄漏清单方面，他向我做了详细介绍。

• 报告与会议发言

在欧洲期间，我受邀参加了几次活动作为报告人或者发言人，话题主要是围绕磐石在能源和气候变化方面所做的研究。

- ✓ 在布鲁塞尔的交换启动会上，我简要介绍了中国的政治体系，让欧洲参会人员对于中国的政策决策机制有所了解。Sanjeev 则介绍了欧盟的政治制度，使中方人员简要了解了欧盟政策制定过程。
- ✓ 我在柏林参加了 BUNDjugend 的晚间讨论会，并作为发言嘉宾来给德国青年学生和有兴趣人士讲解中国的能源与气候变化政策，到会的人对于此议题很感兴趣，也引起了大家的讨论。也有学生表示对于我们的工作想深入了解，还有学生希望能给他们的论文提出意见。
- ✓ 创绿中心在 COP21 组织了中欧 NGO 对话，Sanjeev 和我都作为发言人发表了对于碳市场以及气候政策的见解。

我从交换项目收获了什么？

首先，我获得了两个好朋友和工作伙伴，他们就是 Sanjeev Kumar 和他的同事 Anna Dubowik。他们在交换期间对我的支持让我在欧洲期间的工作和生活方便很多。

通过在欧洲期间所计划的多样化活动，我让自己对于所谓的利益相关方有了更深的了解，NGOs、政府机构、行业、媒体以及学界各自的作用在这里体现的很充分。这些对我们未来的工作和生活都是很珍贵的记忆和经验。尤其是在欧洲访谈的行业专业人士，他们都那么谦虚并乐于帮助你，这让我感触颇深。

此外，我也很荣幸能跟项目中的其他交换伙伴成为朋友，我们也已经在保持联系并且分享活动和合作的机会。交换项目的校友网络变得越来越大，这也意味着更大的联系人资源，通过微信群聊，我们也了解到交换伙伴们以及交换项目的最新信息。

对交换项目的建议

对于交换项目的安排时间可以有多些选择，欧盟伙伴来中国的时间可以与目前的时间对调下，也就是中方人员能在9月份去欧洲，这样对于中方人员也有更多的灵活性，因为年底的时候往往是机构最忙的时候。

Report on EU-China NGO Twinning program

by Lin Jiaqiao, Rock Environment & Energy Institute (REEI), Beijing, Jan 2016

Twinning with

Sanjeev Kumar, Change Partnership (Brussels)

Change Partnership is a NGO and think-tank focused on the politics of climate change. It delivers outputs through the generation of policy solutions, diverse political coalitions to secure specific legislative outcomes. It was founded in 2013 and has offices in Brussels, Warsaw and London.

Topic of Exchange

Climate Change & Low-carbon Development: The impacts of energy and climate measures on industrial competitiveness as well as the discussion on transition models for high-carbon regions

Change Partnership and the Rock Environment and Energy Institute (REEI) has collaborated on the research of the using carbon markets and carbon finance to direct low-carbon investment and rebuild sustainable regional economic growth.

The ultimate purpose is to establish dialogues among different stakeholders such as regional governments, trade unions and industry between China and the Europe, in discussion of the co-operation opportunities for a quicker transition to a low-carbon economy, because the EU and China face similar hurdles to overcome from politically sensitive regions dominated by a single or a few carbon-intensive industries, which are often the main source of local wealth and employment. Failure to adequately address their concerns could significantly undermine the pace at which climate and energy policy delivers the required transformative change.

Main Activities in China

Sanjeev came to China by the end of August 2015 before the Hangzhou workshop and had stayed 3 weeks afterwards in Sep 2015. We arranged various activities during this period of time including workshop and interviews, to get him more familiar with our proposed work in the Chinese context and also deepen our knowledge through the exchange of ideas with the relevant experts in the field of climate change and energy.

- **Organized an Event on Carbon Market**

Together with Change Partnership, we jointly organized a seminar regarding comparison and experience sharing between the EU-ETS and CN-ETS in Beijing,

on the date of 14th Sep 2015, with a strong guest speakers team, besides Sanjeev and I, we also invited officer from EU Delegation Ms. Vicky Pollard to China and Mr. Chen Zhibin from the leading carbon consultancy SinoCarbon. The participants were of a wide spectrum, ranging from NGOs, think tanks, academia, media, to industry players such as the power companies.

Through presentation and discussion, people working in this regard could have a better understanding of what is required for the establishment of the unified domestic carbon market in China by drawing lessons from the EU-ETS; and what are the potential consequences of this market mechanisms to industry and what needs for a Just Transition to a low carbon economy.

- **Interviews**

There are many interviews scheduled during the period of Sanjeev coming to China (3 weeks in Sep 2015). The main target groups are people working in carbon market and the electric vehicle industry including battery companies, professors and NGOs.

- ✓ Carbon Market:

- China Beijing Environmental Exchange (CBEX): We visited the research team of CBEX and exchanged ideas on the development of China ETS, especially the Beijing ETS pilot; CBEX was also interested in knowing the experience from the EU ETS, which Sanjeev shared his knowledge.
- Shanghai Environment and Energy Exchange (SEEE): Dr Lijin represented the SEEE to meet us, and she introduced the development of their work and gave an introduction of the future China national ETS and their views.
- Shanghai Zhixin Carbon: We interviewed their carbon project development team and learned a lot regarding the current and future use and trading of carbon offsets (CCER). Also, they shared their ideas on the national ETS as well.
- Vicky Pollard (First Counsellor, Environment and Climate Change, Delegation of EU to China and Mongolia): Vicky introduced her work and gave us some ideas on the high-level policy trend of climate change in China.

- ✓ Electric Vehicle

- Narada Battery Power: One of the biggest battery manufacturer in China, and we had a good conversation with their Zhejiang regional General Manager, he introduced the company and shared his view regarding the future power storage market and the development trend of electric vehicles in China and overseas. They showed particular interest of the European market.

- Tongji University: We visited Professor Wu Xiaoyuan from the School of Automobiles, she specialized in new energy vehicle policy research at Tongji University. She gave us a sound update on the policy side of EV's development in China and also enquired us the situation of EV in the EU, from both policy and industry angles.
- Energy Foundation China: The transport policy advisor from Energy Foundation China met us and we had a better idea of the transport policy as a whole in China after the discussion.

Also, Sanjeev separately visited several embassy staff who work in energy and climate change aspect during his trip.

- **Paper Drafting**

We are in the process of completing a paper discussing the transport electrification in China and its implication for the EU. The main audience is for the European audience, to give them a summary analysis of the current development of EV industry in China and what the EU should aim for a more effective co-operation. Apart from EV, electric bikes are also discussed in the paper, since this should be part of the transport electrification in China started more than a decade ago.

Main Activities in Europe

During the period of 01st Nov till 11th Dec 2015, I had spent nearly 6 weeks in Europe, and most of the time I was based in Brussels and working together with Sanjeev, many interesting workshops were attended and interviews conducted in various countries.

It was lucky for me to have the exchange there in Brussels and had the opportunities to attend several high-level meetings and exchange ideas with local NGOs, since Change Partnership's office is located in an NGO hub in Brussels. In Brussels, I witnessed the style of co-operative working among different stake holders and also got a real sense what the industry is lobbying there with their specific interest to be represented, and most of the time the EU policy comes to a compromise by balancing different party's interests.

- **Attending conferences/workshops**

Since Brussels is the headquarter of the top EU administration and executive bodies, there are numerous high-level events that are open to civil society. I chose the ones related to carbon market and industrial policy to attend.

Through these events, I've got to know better of how the EU institutions operate and litigation process in the EU, which is useful as Chinese NGOs have recently been given access to challenge pollution by corporates in local judiciary.

- **Paris COP21**

While at the Paris COP21, I have the chance of attending several events related to my work on carbon market and energy issues, organized by different prestigious institutions. It was also a good occasion to meet potential partner organizations and foundations.

- **Interviews**

Apart from the workshops in Brussels, I've conducted several interviews whilst that period of time in Europe, taking the advantage of being close to each other institutions which I want to talk with.

- ✓ London: Accompanied by Sanjeev, I visited UK DECC (Department of Energy and Climate Change) and had a discussion with the EU-ETS team regarding the ETS reform. Also, I had a talk with Mr. James Thornton, CEO of Client Earth, and introduced our work in Beijing, which he showed particular interest in our energy and air pollution initiative.
- ✓ Germany: Very productive trip to Berlin, where I met researchers from Agora Energiewende, the leading think tank working on energiewende issues; Team Leader from German and EU Climate Policy German Watch had an in-depth discussion with me at their office, especially the role of NGO in the energiewende in Germany. Also, I met China focal point of The International Carbon Action Partnership (ICAP) and exchanged ideas regarding the CN-ETS. Last but not least, I was invited to the Heinrich Boll Stiftung headquarter and had a meeting with their Project Manager China and Pakistan and Department Head Ecology and Sustainable Development.
- ✓ France: Mr. Dong Yue from the Ministry of Sustainable Development and Energy met me and we exchanged ideas on the EU-ETS, and he particularly explained to me the carbon leakage list to me into detail.

- **As Presenters**

I was invited to speak at several occasions whilst in Europe, mainly regarding energy and climate change issues and REEI's research analysis in terms of both:

- ✓ At the exchange workshop held in Brussels, I spoke briefly about the Chinese political system and gave the European audience an extensive overview of the policy-making process in China using charts/diagrams and case studies. The European side of participants were particularly interested in this topic and enquired further on the development of China's New Environmental Protection Law and its implications.
- ✓ In Berlin, I spoke at the BUNDjugend's evening discussion event and gave the German audience a quick review of China's energy and climate change policy, which sparked up some interesting discussions. In the follow-up

talks, some students are interested in our work and asked for opinions on their dissertation.

- ✓ Also, the China-EU NGO Dialogue organized by Greenovation Hub at the COP21, both Sanjeev and I were invited to speak and share our ideas on ETS and climate policy.

What I have gained from the Exchange

First of all, I've gained two workmates and friends there in Brussels, Sanjeev Kumar and his colleague Anna Dubowik. Their support for me during the exchange period is huge and I'd like to thank them for all their efforts.

Through the activities planned during the exchange period in Europe, I had engaged myself in diverse activities and got to know extensive stakeholders such as NGOs, governmental organs, industry, media and academia. I'd say it was a unique experience, and I've got some precious input to my future work and life. Especially the people I interviewed there in Europe, some of them are real experts, but they are very modest and easy to get along with, I benefited a lot from them both in knowledge and way of doing things.

Also, I have the pleasure to meet the other twinnings in the exchange programme, and we've already sharing knowledge and activities. I believe there will more opportunities to work together in the future. The alumni network is getting bigger and bigger, which means more connections are available there, through the WeChat group account, we were updated the latest information of the twinnings and the exchange programme itself.

Suggestions to the Exchange

The time arrangement for the exchange, namely when the EU side coming to China and the opposite should be swapped, since the previous years are all EU twinnings coming to China first followed by the Chinese going to the EU later. It is reasonable to change this style a bit in the coming exchanges.